



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Book Reviews

Ennius und Vergilius: Kriegsbilder aus Roms grosser Zeit. By EDUARD NORDEN. Berlin: B. G. Teubner, 1915. Pp. v+176.

The task of restoring a work of ancient literature which is known to us only in "fragments" is, of all the tasks which confront the modern student, the most alluring and the most dangerous, offering as it does a field in which difference of opinion is almost universal, and in which imagination runs riot until some treasure-trove, in the form of an *Epitrepones* or an *Ichneutae*, shows how wide of the mark our guesses were. We may well, then, congratulate ourselves when a scholar of such established authority as the author of the *Kunstprosa* studies for us the works of a writer even in whose *disiecta membra* Horace declares the poet may still be found.

Norden's work, very fittingly inscribed to Cichorius, who performed such signal service for the satires of Lucilius, is principally occupied with the identification, arrangement, and connection of the fragments of the seventh book of the *Annals*, which, although in point of number they are exceeded only by those of book i, have never been adequately treated. Deprived of any such important clue to the relative order of the fragments as the editor of Lucilius or Varro has in the order which the citations of Nonius follow, Norden must place his main reliance upon the historians of the period, and by dint of diligent search he has wrung from Livy, Polybius, Justin and the annalists much new evidence as to the historical setting of our fragments. But mythology too is powerful in epic tradition, and history cannot follow the flights of poetic fancy. Here Norden has recourse to Virgil, the full use of whose guidance in this field he is the first to make. The results of his investigation, first for Ennius and then for Virgil, are as follows.

If we are to believe Cicero's statement (*Brutus* 76), the strange neglect of which by recent scholars is mainly responsible for their failure to bring even conjectural order out of the chaos of the seventh book, Ennius himself expressly says that he has omitted from his *Annals* any consideration of the First Punic War. Then all the military fragments of *Annals* vii are to be referred to the Second Punic War, which will form the principal theme of the book. The important omission of the First Punic War was forced upon Ennius by his desire to avoid encroaching upon the *Bellum Punicum* of his predecessor Naevius, to whom in the exordium of vii the poet refers in the purposely vague *alii* of l. 213. To the exordium likewise belong the interesting lines 218 f. Here we have a part of the poet's answer to those critics of his own time, who, as Horace later, found fault with him for not having fulfilled the high promise offered by the dream with which the first book of this *alter Homerus*

began. Following the exordium there is a retrospective account of the origin and history of Carthage. So Cato (*Origines* iv), Livy (*Periocha*, Book xvi), and Justin (xviii. 3), as a preface to their accounts of the Punic wars; and compare Virgil's *urbs antiqua fuit*, etc., immediately following the invocation in *Aeneid* i. To this historical account are to be assigned (Vahlen's numbering): ll. 222 (331 B.C.), 220 f. (310 B.C.), 265, 225-31 and 252 (260 B.C.), 274 (237 B.C.). Thereupon ensues the symbolical scene which introduces the real subject of the book. Discordia, summoned from Tartarus by Juno, at her behest bursts asunder the but recently closed doors of the temple of Janus (235 B.C.), and is dismissed to her abiding-place in the lower world: ll. 521 f., 266 f., 260-63. Rome's second struggle with Carthage is thus begun. She also faces an uprising of the Gauls (225 B.C.): ll. 164 f. (which are here reminiscent of the storming of the Capitolium in 387 B.C.), and l. 256 (the battle of Telamon). The crossing of the Ebro by Hannibal (May, 218 B.C.) produces a crisis signalized by a council of the gods, in which Jupiter resigns for the time being his opposition to Juno's unflagging hostility to Rome: ll. 259, 257, 258. An attempt on the part of Rome to recruit allies in Spain fails (218 B.C.): l. 503. Her troops are defeated at the Trebia (December 21, 218 B.C.): ll. 232 f. Scipio concludes an alliance in Spain (218 B.C.): l. 253. From this point on there are no certain fragments. The book ends not later than the summer of 216 B.C., for the battle of Cannae is treated in viii.

That there is no small amount of conjecture in all this scarcely needs to be stated, but in general this outline of the seventh book may be regarded as established. Now what of Virgil?

Without, of course, denying that Virgil is primarily dependent on Homer, Norden believes that, just as in *Aeneid* i, which begins Virgil's Odyssey (the *virum* of his epic), he relies upon the first book of Naevius, so in book vii, which begins his Iliad (the *arma*), he approaches Homer mainly through his fellow-*Maeonides*, Ennius. In Ennius, Juno summons Discordia (=Empedocles' *Nēkōs*, i.e. *Epis*), and puts into her hands the task of arousing enmity between the Romans and the Carthaginians. This Discordia is Virgil's Allecto, whose services Juno enlists to stir up strife between the Trojans and the subjects of Latinus. But Virgil, obsessed with the priority of the Juno-motif from his first book, has Allecto dismissed before her task is completed and on a quite inadequate pretext (ll. 540-71), that he may assign to Juno the culminating act of opening the *belli ferratos postes*. There is furthermore a striking correspondence between Virgil's description of the *Ampsanti valles* (563 ff.), and the spot at which Ennius stages the disappearance of his Spirit of Strife (ll. 260-63). So also the *concilium deorum* which the older poet places at the crucial point in vii is the model of the similar council which opens *Aeneid* x, after the Aristeia of Turnus in ix has brought the fortunes of the Trojans to their lowest ebb.

Other important points of contact between the two poets in their treatment of whole episodes are the following. Virgil's description of the fall

of Troy in *Aeneid* ii, for which Homer was not available, was based on Ennius' account of the fall of Alba before the armies of Tullus Hostilius in *Annals* ii, which is in close accord with Livy's account of this episode in ii. 29. Ennius and Livy go back to the same annalistic source. The sham battle in *Aeneid* v. 114-285 is to be referred to Ennius' story in book ix (ll. 480, 478, 484-86, 481, 479) of the regatta instituted for political purposes by Ennius' hero Scipio in Sicily in 204 B.C. Two scenes in *Aeneid* viii are imitations from *Annals* i: the prayer of Aeneas to the Thybris (l. 72)=the prayer of Aeneas to the Tiber (l. 54), and the meeting of Aeneas and Evander (l. 150)=the meeting of Aeneas and the King of Alba (l. 32). Virgil's battle-scene in *Aeneid* x. 308 ff. is patterned on the description in Ennius represented by ll. 443 ff., 572, 587, 472 f. Finally, the renunciation of her long-continued persecution of the Trojans which Juno makes in her conversation with Jupiter in *Aeneid* xii. 791 ff. is based upon a similar dialogue in *Annals* vii (l. 291), where Juno agrees to cease opposing the Romans, and so motivates the turning of the tide in favor of the latter after the disaster at Cannae.

Such are the main contentions of this very suggestive and stimulating book, which, despite the uncertainties that must attend upon such work, throws new light upon the epic technique of both Ennius and Virgil, and considerably strengthens one of the links in the great epic chain which stretches from Homer to Milton.

ROBERT H. WEBB

UNIVERSITY OF VIRGINIA

The Four in Crete. By GERTRUDE H. BEGGS. New York and Cincinnati: Abingdon Press. Pp. 182. \$1.25 net.

One fault with this book the reviewer wishes to state at once: it is too short. The style is so easy and graceful, the story is so charmingly told, with all its colloquialisms and the breeziness of the author's native Colorado, that one can lay the volume down only when he has finished it. Even then one reads the last page with a sigh of regret, wishing that the story might have gone on and on, like Tennyson's brook, if the author will pardon the reviewer for his hackneyed reference!

"The Four," consist of the Scholar, the Sage, the Coffee Angel, and the Western Woman. The book is divided into five parts, the first of which explains the reasons that led the little party to visit Crete, notwithstanding the many difficulties in the way, and tells about the night voyage to Crete, which was pleasant when compared with the return voyage, and about the arrival at the Hotel Knossos in Candia. From the beginning the Western Woman manifests a disdain for classical learning and archaeology, and this is one of the charms of the book. A deep knowledge of the classics and of archaeology is clearly shown all through the volume, but it is all brought in so simply and naturally that even the Philistine reader may not be aware of the fact that he